

1 BROCK & GONZALES, LLP
2 D. Aaron Brock (SBN 241919)
3 ab@brockgonzales.com
4 Christina R. Kerner (SBN 319474)
5 ck@brockgonzales.com
6 Elizabeth A. Siruno (SBN 337132)
7 es@brockgonzales.com
8 6701 Center Drive West, Suite 610
9 Los Angeles, California 90045
10 Telephone: (310) 294-9595

11 Attorneys for Plaintiff
12 JULIA WILSON

13 SEYFARTH SHAW LLP
14 Mandana Massoumi (SBN 191359)
15 mmassoumi@seyfarth.com
16 Heather E. Horn (SBN 318242)
17 hhorn@seyfarth.com
18 2029 Century Park East, Suite 3500
19 Los Angeles, California 90067-3021
20 Telephone: (310) 277-7200
21 Facsimile: (310) 201-5219

22 Attorneys for Defendant
23 TARGET CORPORATION

24 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

25 CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA – EASTERN DIVISION

26 JULIA WILSON, an individual,

27 Plaintiff,

28 v.

TARGET CORPORATION, a Minnesota
corporation; and DOES 1-50, inclusive,

Defendants.

Case No. 5:23-cv-00708 FWS (KKx)

[*The Honorable Fred W. Slaughter;*

Magistrate Judge Kenly Kato]

**STIPULATED PROTECTIVE
ORDER**

Complaint Filed: February 28, 2023

Removal Filed: April 21, 2023

Trial Date: April 16, 2024

1 **I. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS**

2 A. Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential,
3 proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public
4 disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation
5 may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition
6 the Court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties
7 acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all
8 disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from
9 public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items
10 that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable legal
11 principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section XIII(C),
12 below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file
13 confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the
14 procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied
15 when a party seeks permission from the Court to file material under seal.

16 **II. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT**

17 A. The dispute in this action involves allegations of disability discrimination,
18 ultimately involving the discovery of information relating to private medical
19 information of Plaintiff, Julia Wilson, and confidential business practices of
20 Defendant, Target Corporation. During the course of this litigation, highly
21 confidential and proprietary information will need to be shared through
22 discovery or otherwise between the parties and the Court.
23 Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to facilitate the prompt
24 resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery materials, to
25 adequately protect information the parties are entitled to keep confidential,
26 to ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such
27 material in preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their
28 handling at the end of the litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a

protective order for such information is justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that information will not be designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so designated without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential, non-public manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part of the public record of this case.

So that both parties can continue to protect their proprietary and private information involving descriptions of business methods not generally known to the public and personal information as to the plaintiff, the parties propose this Stipulation.

III. DEFINITIONS

- A. Action: this pending federal law suit, *Julia Wilson v. Target Corporation*, Case No. 5:23-cv-00708 FWS (KKx)
- B. Challenging Party: A Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of information or items under this Order.
- C. “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: Information (regardless of how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in the Good Cause Statement.
- D. Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as their support staff).
- E. Designating Party: A Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as “CONFIDENTIAL.”
- F. Disclosure or Discovery Material: All items or information, regardless of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things),

1 that are produced or generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in
2 this matter.

3 G. Expert: A person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter
4 pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to
5 serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

6 H. House Counsel: Attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action.
7 House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other
8 outside counsel.

9 I. Non-Party: Any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or
10 other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

11 J. Outside Counsel of Record: Attorneys who are not employees of a party to
12 this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and
13 have appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a
14 law firm which has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support
15 staff.

16 K. Party: Any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,
17 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record
18 (and their support staffs).

19 L. Producing Party: A Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or
20 Discovery Material in this Action.

21 M. Professional Vendors: Persons or entities that provide litigation support
22 services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or
23 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or
24 medium) and their employees and subcontractors.

25 N. Protected Material: Any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated
26 as "CONFIDENTIAL."

27 O. Receiving Party: A Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material
28 from a Producing Party.

1 **IV. SCOPE**

2 A. The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only
3 Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or
4 extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or
5 compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or
6 presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected
7 Material.

8 B. Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the
9 trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

10 **V. DURATION**

11 A. Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations
12 imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees
13 otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition
14 shall be deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in
15 this Action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the
16 completion and exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or
17 reviews of this Action, including the time limits for filing any motions or
18 applications for extension of time pursuant to applicable law.

19 **VI. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL**

20 A. Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection

- 21 1. Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for
22 protection under this Order must take care to limit any such
23 designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate
24 standards. The Designating Party must designate for protection only
25 those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written
26 communications that qualify so that other portions of the material,
27 documents, items, or communications for which protection is not
28 warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

2. Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating Party to sanctions.
3. If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

B. Manner and Timing of Designations

1. Except as otherwise provided in this Order (*see, e.g.*, Section B(2)(b) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or produced.
2. Designation in conformity with this Order requires the following:
 - a. For information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" (hereinafter "CONFIDENTIAL legend"), to each page that contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).
 - b. A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which documents it would

like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be deemed “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the inspecting Party has identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the “CONFIDENTIAL legend” to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

- c. For testimony given in depositions, that the Designating Party identify the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the deposition all protected testimony.
- d. For information produced in form other than document and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the legend “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information warrants protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

C. Inadvertent Failure to Designate

- 1. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must

1 make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in
2 accordance with the provisions of this Order.

3 **VII. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS**

4 **A. Timing of Challenges**

- 5 1. Any party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of
6 confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court's
7 Scheduling Order.

8 **B. Meet and Confer**

- 9 1. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution process
10 under Local Rule 37.1 et seq.

- 11 C. The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the
12 Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper
13 purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on
14 other parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the
15 Designating Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation,
16 all parties shall continue to afford the material in question the level of
17 protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's designation
18 until the Court rules on the challenge.

19 **VIII. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

20 **A. Basic Principles**

- 21 1. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or
22 produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this
23 Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this
24 Action. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to the
25 categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order.
26 When the Action has been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply
27 with the provisions of Section XIV below.
28

2. Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

B. Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items

1. Unless otherwise ordered by the Court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:
 - a. The Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this Action;
 - b. The officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action;
 - c. Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);
 - d. The Court and its personnel;
 - e. Court reporters and their staff;
 - f. Professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to be Bound” attached as Exhibit A hereto;
 - g. The author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

- h. During their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (i) the deposing party requests that the witness sign the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound;” and (ii) they will not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they sign the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound,” unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the Court. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and
- i. Any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel, mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

IX. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION

- A. If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:
1. Promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;
 2. Promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

3. Cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

B. If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the Court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

X. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION

A. The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in this Action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

B. In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a Non-Party’s confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party’s confidential information, then the Party shall:

1. Promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;

2. Promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the information requested; and
3. Make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party, if requested.

C. If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

XI. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

A. If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (1) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (2) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (3) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, and (4) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

XII. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED MATERIAL

A. When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other

1 protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in
2 Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended
3 to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order
4 that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to
5 Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an
6 agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or information
7 covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the
8 parties may incorporate their agreement in the Stipulated Protective Order
9 submitted to the Court.

10 **XIII. MISCELLANEOUS**

11 **A. Right to Further Relief**

- 12 1. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its
13 modification by the Court in the future.

14 **B. Right to Assert Other Objections**

- 15 1. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order, no Party waives
16 any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing
17 any information or item on any ground not addressed in this
18 Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to
19 object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered
20 by this Protective Order.

21 **C. Filing Protected Material**

- 22 1. A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected Material must
23 comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may only be
24 filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the
25 specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file
26 Protected Material under seal is denied by the Court, then the
27 Receiving Party may file the information in the public record unless
28 otherwise instructed by the Court.

1 **XIV. FINAL DISPOSITION**

- 2 A. After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in Section V, within
3 sixty (60) days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving
4 Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy
5 such material. As used in this subdivision, “all Protected Material” includes
6 all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries, and any other format
7 reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether the
8 Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit
9 a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or
10 entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by
11 category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or
12 destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any
13 copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing
14 or capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision,
15 Counsel are entitled to retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion
16 papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda,
17 correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work
18 product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such materials
19 contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or
20 constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set
21 forth in Section V.
- 22 B. Any violation of this Order may be punished by any and all appropriate
23 measures including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or
24 monetary sanctions.

25 **IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.**
26
27
28

1 DATED: June 16, 2023

BROCK & GONZALES, LLP

3 By: /s/ Christina R. Kerner

4 D. Aaron Brock
5 Christina R. Kerner
6 Elizabeth A. Siruno
7 Attorneys for Plaintiff
8 Julia Wilson

9 DATED: June 16, 2023

SEYFARTH SHAW LLP

10 By: /s/ Heather E. Horn

11 Mandana Massoumi
12 Heather E. Horn
13 Attorneys for Defendant
14 TARGET CORPORATION

15 **FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.**

16 Dated: June 16, 2023

17 

18 Kenly Kiya Kato
19 United States Magistrate Judge
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

EXHIBIT A
ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, _____ [print or type full name], of _____
 _____ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read
 in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issue by the United
 States District Court for the Central District of California on _____ [date] in the case
 of *Julia Wilson v. Target Corporation*, Case No. 5:23-cv-00708 FWS (KKx). I agree to
 comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I
 understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and
 punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any
 manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any
 person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for
 the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated
 Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this
 action. I hereby appoint _____ [print or type full name] of ____
 _____ [print or type full address and telephone number] as my
 California agent for service of process in connection with this action or any proceedings
 related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.

Date: _____

City and State where sworn and signed: _____

Printed Name: _____

Signature: _____